BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
0 1761 03324 2827

Cases and Materials on Restitution

Edited by

John D. McCamus
Dean
Osgoode Hall Law School

and

Peter D. Maddaugh
of the Ontario Bar

1986 - 87 Edition

FOR STUDENT USE ONLY
NOT FOR COMMERCIAL SALE
1986-87

Osgoode Hall Law School
of York University

LAW LIBRARY

DEC 9 1988

FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

FACULTY OF LAW LIBRARY
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

Cases and Materials on Restitution

Edited by

John D. McCamus
Dean
Osgoode Hall Law School

and

Peter D. Maddaugh
of the Ontario Bar

1986 - 87 Edition

FOR STUDENT USE ONLY
NOT FOR COMMERCIAL SALE
1986-87

Osgoode Hall Law School
of York University

Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

https://archive.org/details/casesmaterialson00mcca

Cases and Materials on Restitution

Summary of Contents

Part I Introductory Materials 1

Part II The Substantive Grounds for Restitutionary Relief 49

1. Restitution of Benefits Conferred by Mistake 49

A. Recovery of Moneys Paid under a Mistake of Fact .. 49

B. Mistake of Law 105

C. Recovery of Other Benefits Conferred Under a Mistake 146

2. Restitution of Benefits Conferred Under Ineffective Transactions 167

(i) Informality 167
(ii) Illegality 172
(iii) Incapacity 254
(iv) Want of Authority 308
(v) Misrepresentation 319
(vi) Mistake and Uncertainty 342
(vii) Discharge by Breach 376
(viii) Frustration 390
(ix) Anticipated Contracts and Gifts 402

3. Recovery of the Profits of Wrongdoing 415

(i) Criminal and Quasi-Criminal Acts 415
(ii) Waiver of Tort 435
(iii) Compulsion 473
(iv) Breach of Fiduciary Duties 538
(v) Unconscionable Transactions 597
(vi) Other Forms of Equitable Wrongdoing 614

4. Compulsory Discharge of Another's Liability 654

5. Unrequested Benefits and the Volunteer 680

6. Restitutionary Liability of Public Authorities 739

Part III Restitutionary Remedies 788

A. Common Law Remedies 788

(i) Tracing Property other than Money 788
(ii) Tracing Money 803

B. Equitable Remedies 818

(i) The Constructive Trust 818
(ii) The Equitable Lien 850
(iii) Tracing in Equity 851

C. Concurrent Remedies 865

(i) Subrogation 865
(ii) Contribution 913

Cases and Materials on Restitution

Table of Contents

PART I Introductory Materials

Introduction 1
Samek, Unjust Enrichment, etc. 2
Restatement of Restitution 4
Moses v. McFerlan 13
Sinclair v. Brougham 17
Deglman v. Guaranty Trust Co. 25
Saint John Tugboat v. Irving Refinery 29
Pettkus v. Becker 32

PART II THE SUBSTANTIVE GROUNDS FOR RESTITUTIONARY RELIEF

1. RESTITUTION OF BENEFITS CONFERRED UNDER MISTAKE

A. Mistake of Fact

Royal Bank of Canada v. The King 49

(a) An Honest Mistake

Kelly v. Solari 55
Clark v. Eckroyd 57

(b) Between the Parties

Note 61

(c) A Supposed Obligation to Pay

Larner v. London County Council 61
Lady Hood of Avalon v. MacKinnon 63

(d) No Equity in the Defendant to Retain Payment

Krebs v. World Finance Co. Ltd. 67
R.E. Jones v. Waring & Gillow Ltd. 71
Rural Municipality of Storthoaks v. Mobil Oil Canada Ltd. 82

(e) A Restatement

Barclays Bank v. W.J. Simms Son and Cooke Ltd. 94

B. Mistake of Law

(a) The General Rule

Bilbie v. Lumley and Others 105
O'Grady v. City of Toronto 106

(b) Distinguishing Between Mistakes of Law and Fact

Eaglesfield v. Marquis of Londonderry 108
Macfarlane and Wellington Hotel v. Kennedy .. 109
George (Porky) Jacobs Enterprises Ltd. v. City of Regina 113

(c) Exceptions to the Rule in Equity

Note 115
Eadie v. Township of Brantford 116
Keddy v. Power 122

(d) A Restatement?

Hydro-Electric Commission of Nepean v. Ontario Hydro 126

C. Recovery of Other Benefits Conferred Under Mistake

(i) Improvements to Land

Montreuil v. Ontario Asphalt Co. 146

(ii) Improvements to Chattels

Greenwood v. Bennett et al 163

2. RESTITUTION OF BENEFITS CONFERRED UNDER INEFFECTIVE TRANSACTIONS

(i) Informality

Deglman v. Guaranty Trust Co. 25
Sigvaldson v. Hitsman 169

(ii) Illegality

Note 172

(a) Enforcement of Collateral Rights

Bowmakers v. Barnet Instruments 173
Belvoir Finance v. Stapleton 178

(b) Exceptions to the General Rule Denying Restitution

Kiriri Cotton Co. Ltd. v. Dewani 184
Hasiuk v. Oshanek 190
Steinberg v. Cohen 193
Kasumu and Others v. Baba-Egbe 204
Sidmay Ltd. et al. v. Wehttam Investments Ltd. 211
Ciz v. Hauka 222
Berne Developments Ltd. v. Haviland et al. .. 225
Bigos v. Boustead 237

(c) The Rise and Fall of Subrogation

Congresbury Motors v. Anglo-Belge Finance ... 244
Orakpo v. Manson Investments 248

(iii) Incapacity

(a) Ultra Vires Contracts

Note 254
Trades Hall Co. v. Erie Tobacco Co. 256
Breckenridge Speedway et al. v. The Queen ... 270

(b) Mental Incompetence

Note 290
Wilson v. The King 290

(c) Minors' Contracts

Note 291
R. Leslie Limited v. Sheill 294
Murray v. Dean 302
Bo-Lassen v. Josiassen 303

(iv) Want of Authority

Craven-Ellis v. Canons Ltd. 308
Hazlewood et al. v. West Coast Securities Ltd. 312

(v) Misrepresentation

(a) Executed Contracts

Leaf v. International Galleries 320
Bevan v. Anderson et al. 324
Misrepresentation Act (U.K.) 332
The Business Practices Act (Ont.) 333

(b) Consequential Relief, Indemnity

Wiley et al. v. Fortin et al. 338

(vi) Mistake and Uncertainty

(a) Mistake

Note 342
Boulton v. Jones 343
Cooper v. Phibbs 345
Solle v. Butcher 350
McCarthy Milling Co. Ltd. v.
Elder Packing Co. Ltd. 357
James More & Sons Ltd. v.
University of Ottawa 362

(b) Uncertainty

Estok v. Heguy 372

(vii) Discharge by Breach

(a) The Rights of the Innocent Party

Hunt v. Silk 376
Planche v. Colburn and Another 379

(b) The Rights of the Party in Breach

Sumpter v. Hedges 380
Fairbanks Soap Co. Ltd. v. Sheppard 382
Stockloser v. Johnson 386

(viii) Frustration

The Frustrated Contracts Act (Ont.) 390
The Frustrated Contracts Act (B.C.) 393
Parsons v. Shea 396
Angus v. Scully 401

(ix) Anticipated Contracts and Gifts

(a) Contracts

Brewer Street Investments v. Barclays Woollen 402

(b) Gifts

Rowe v. Public Trustee 409

3. RECOVERY OF THE PROFITS OF WRONGDOING

(i) Criminal and Quasi-Criminal Acts

(a) Direct Profits

Note 415
Re Johnson 416
Schobelt v. Barber 423
Gray v. Barr 428

(b) Indirect Profits

Rosenfeldt v. Olson 435a

(ii) Waiver of Tort

Note 435h

(a) The Election Problem

United Australia Ltd. v. Barclays Bank Ltd. 436
Mahesan v. Malaysian Gov't Housing Society .. 448

(b) The Scope of the Doctrine

Phillips v. Homfrey 455
Daniel v. O'Leary 467

(c) The Measure of Recovery

Olwell v. Nye & Nisson Co. 469

(iii) Compulsion

(a) Duress

Note 473
Skeate v. Beale 475

(b) Practical Compulsion

Knutson v. Bourkes Syndicate 479
Peter Kiewet Sons Co. of Canada Ltd. et al.
v. Eakins Construction Ltd. 483
The 'Siboen' and the 'Sibotre' 492
North Ocean Shipping v. Hyundai 495
Pao On et al. v. Lan Yiu et al. 505
Morton Construction v. City of Hamilton 514
George (Porky) Jacobs Enterprises Ltd.
v. City of Regina 520
Eadie v. Township of Brantford 521

(c) Undue Influence

Note 526
McKenzie v. Bank of Montreal et al. 529

(iv) Breach of Fiduciary Duties

Note 538

(a) Establishing a Fiduciary Relationship

Midcon Oil and Gas Ltd. v. New British Dominion Oil Co. Ltd. 539
Jirna Ltd. v. Mister Donut of Canada Ltd. ... 555
Pre-Cam Exploration & Development Ltd. et al. v. McTavish et al. 566

(b) The Duty of Loyalty

McLeod and More v. Sweezy 570

(c) Breach of the Duty of Loyalty

Reading v. Attorney-General 575
Canadian Aero Services Ltd. v. O'Malley 580

(d) Liability for Breach of the Duty of Loyalty

Note 595

(v) Unconscionable Transactions

Waters v. Donnelly 597
Gaertner v. Fiesta Dance Studios 603
Clifford Davis Management Ltd. v. WEA Records Ltd. 606
Morrison v. Coast Finance Ltd. 609

(vi) Other Forms of Equitable Wrongdoing

Unsworth v. Grant 614

(a) Hiding Behind The Statute of Frauds

Note 623

(b) Dishonoured Undertakings: Interests in Land

Note 625
Binions v. Evans 626

(c) Dishonoured Undertakings: Restrictive Covenants

Note 630

(d) Abuse of Confidence

Saltman Engineering Co. Ltd. v. Campbell Engineering Co. Ltd. 633

(e) Refusal to Share Spousal Assets on Separation

Rathwell v. Rathwell 636
Pettkus v. Becker 32

4. COMPULSORY DISCHARGE OF ANOTHER'S LIABILITY

Moule v. Garrett 654
D & J Motors Ltd. v. Ellis 655
Brooks Wharf and Bull Wharf Ltd. v. Goodman Bros. 659
County of Carleton v. City of Ottawa 663
General Security Ins. Co. of Canada v. Howard Sand & Gravel Co. Ltd. 669
Lambert Implements Ltd. v. Pardell et al. 676

5. UNREQUESTED BENEFITS AND THE VOLUNTEER

(a) Agency of Necessity

Hastings v. Village of Semans..... 681

(b) Preservation of Life

Matheson v. Smiley..... 685
Attorney-General for British Columbia v. Parklane Private Hospital Ltd..... 689

(c) Preservation of Property

Nicholson v. Chapman..... 696
Sherrin v. Haggerty..... 698
In re Pike..... 702

(d) Voluntary Discharge of Another's Obligation

Norton v. Haggett..... 704
Falcke v. Scottish Imperial Insurance Co..... 706
Owen v. Tate et al..... 718

(e) The Self-serving Intermeddler

Felton v. Finley..... 725
Nicholson v. St. Denis et al..... 731
Mechanical Contractors Association of Ottawa v. J.G. Rivard Ltd. 735

6. Restitutionary Liability of Public Authorities

William Whitely Ltd. v. R. 739
Mason v. New South Wales 742
Hydro Electric Commission of the Township of Nepean v. Ontario Hydro 750
Amax Potash Ltd. v. Govt. of Saskatchewan 777

PART III RESTITUTIONARY REMEDIES

A. COMMON LAW REMEDIES

Note 788

(i) Tracing Property other than Money

(a) Accessio

Firestone Tire & Rubber Co. of Canada Ltd. v. Industrial Acceptance Corp. Ltd. 789
Jones v. De Marchant 792

(b) Confusio and Commixtio

Lawrie v. Rathbun 796

(c) Specificatio

Silsbury and Calkins v. McCoon and Sherman .. 800

(ii) Tracing Money

Note 803
Taylor v. Plumer 804
Banque Belgue pour l'Etranger v. Hambrouck .. 808

B. EQUITABLE REMEDIES

(i) The Constructive Trust

Note 818

(a) Those Arising out of Express Trusts

Ankcorn v. Stewart 820

(b) Those Arising out of Other Fiduciary Relationships

Note 823

(c) Those Arising out of Fraud

McCormick v. Grogan 825
Pahara et al. v. Pahara 826

(d) The Constructive Trust as a General Remedy

Craddock Bros. v. Hunt 830
Hussey v. Palmer 836
Rathwell v. Rathwell 636
Pettkus v. Becker 32
Sorochan v. Sorochan 840
Chase Manhattan Bank v. Israel-British Bank.. 840i

(ii) The Equitable Lien

Note 850
Montreuil v. Ontario Asphalt Co. 146

(iii) Tracing in Equity

Note 851

(a) When does the Right to Trace in Equity Arise?

Re Hallett's Estate 852
Sinclair v. Brougham 853
Nebraska National Bank v. Johnson 854
Chase Manhattan Bank v. Israel-British Bank 840

(b) When will the Right to Trace in Equity be Lost?

The Rule in Clayton's Case 857
The Rule in Hallett's Case 857
The Rule in Re Oatway 859
The 'Lowest Intermediate Balance' Rule 859
The Available Remedies 861
Competing Beneficial Owners 862
The Innocent Volunteer 863

C. CONCURRENT REMEDIES

(i) Subrogation

Note 865

(a) Subrogation of the Plaintiff to the Rights of the Payee Against a Third Party

Weldon v. Canadian Surety Co. 867
Bayda v. Canada North Dakota Land Co. Ltd. et al. 877
Re Okotoks Milling Co. Ltd. 879
Brown v. McLean 880
Traders Realty Ltd. v. Huron Heights Shopping Plaza Ltd. 884

(b) Subrogation of the Plaintiff to the Rights of a Third Party Against the Payee

Reversion Fund and Insurance Co. Ltd. v. Maison Cosway, Ltd. 888
Congresbury Motors Ltd. v. Anglo-Belge Finance Co. Ltd. 244
Orakpo v. Manson Inv. 248

(c) The "Officious" Subrogee

Campbell Auto Finance Co. v. Warren 898
Re Cleadon Trust Ltd. 905

(ii) Contribution

Brook's Wharf and Bull Wharf Ltd. v. Goodman Bros. 659
Continental Insurance Co. v. Prudential Insurance Co. Ltd. of England 913